



# Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States

A joint project between UNESCO  
and StratREAL Foundation, UK

Final Evaluation Report

February 2013

*The Final Evaluation Report has been prepared by Dr. Jilani Lamloumi, President, Virtual University of Tunis (UNESCO Consultant), as part of the Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States Project (57ORAB1001) workplan for 2012.*

**For more information, please contact one of the following addresses:**

**UNESCO – UNEVOC International Centre for TVET – Bonn**

UN Campus

Hermann-Ehlers-Str.10

53113 Bonn, Germany

Tel: +49 228 815 0120

Fax: +49 228 815 0100

E-mail: [bonn@unesco.org](mailto:bonn@unesco.org); [l.freiburg@unesco.org](mailto:l.freiburg@unesco.org)

[www.unesco.org/unevoc](http://www.unesco.org/unevoc)

**UNESCO Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States - Beirut**

P. O. Box 11-5244

Beirut - Lebanon

Tel: +961 1 8500130/4/5

Fax: +961 1 824 854

E-mail: [beirut@unesco.org](mailto:beirut@unesco.org); [s.suliaman@unesco.org](mailto:s.suliaman@unesco.org)

[www.unesco.org/beirut](http://www.unesco.org/beirut)

---

The ideas and opinions expressed herein are those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of UNESCO.

The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

# Table of Content

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>2. Regional Entrepreneurship Education Project in the Arab States (2009-2012)</b>	<b>5</b>
a. Cooperation between UNESCO and StratREAL Foundation	5
b. Component I of the Project (2009-2010)	5
c. Component II of the Project (2011-2012)	5
<b>3. Major Achievements and Results</b>	<b>6</b>
a. General Policies and Coordination	6
b. Curricula Revision and Development	8
c. Teachers and Instructors Training	11
d. Connectivity and Networking	12
<b>4. Lessons Learnt</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>5. Conclusions and Recommendations</b>	<b>17</b>
References	20
<b>Annexes</b>	
Annex 1: Project Coordinators/Focal Points	21
Annex 2: Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States Project (2009–2012) - Final Evaluation Questionnaire	22

## 1. Introduction

The report involves the findings of the final evaluation of the regional entrepreneurship education project in Arab States component II (2011-2012), which is a joint activity between UNESCO and StratREAL Foundation. It aims to help the development of educational policies enabling the integration of entrepreneurship education within educational systems in Arab States. This project is also complementing many regional programs implemented at the non-formal level by NGOs, local communities and associations and the private sector.

To achieve the report, an overall review of the UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for TVET-Bonn and the UNESCO Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States-Beirut documents and reports related to the project was necessary. Relative projects and initiatives realized at national or international levels have also been considered. The discussions and activities that took place in Manama, Kingdom of Bahrain Regional Workshop on Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States (10-12 December 2012), in which participated the project coordinators, UNESCO representatives, entrepreneurship education experts and specialists in charge of Technical Education and Training in Arab States were also useful. A questionnaire has been distributed during the workshop allowed some discussion and helped in the elaboration of the report as well. (See Annex 2)

The report starts with an overall introduction of the project including a brief description of the stakeholders, the fixed goals and the components. It also focuses the project results and accomplishments. The report also deals with the acquired lessons and ends by giving recommendations for developing entrepreneurship education initiatives at the regional level.

## 2. Entrepreneurship Education Project in the Arab States (2009 – 2012)

The project "Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States" launched by UNESCO in 2008 to promote "entrepreneurship education" in the formal education systems aims to contribute to the development of policies and educational programs that integrate entrepreneurship education in the educational systems in the Middle East and North Africa through supporting decision-makers in the region to develop entrepreneurship education policies and programs.

### a. Cooperation Between UNESCO and StratREAL Foundation

This project falls within the framework of a partnership agreement signed between the UNESCO and the British StratREAL Foundation. The UNESCO-UNEVOC International Center for TVET-Bonn took the initiative in the implementation of the project in cooperation with the UNESCO Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States - Beirut. The UNESCO Offices in the Arab region have also contributed in its implementation.

Under **Component I (2009-2010)**, four countries, namely Egypt, Jordan, Oman and Tunisia have been concerned. In the framework of **Component II (2011-2012)**, the project included four countries: Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, and Oman. It should be noted that the documents and experiences and lessons learned in all the project phases are not limited to the countries directly involved in the project but it is of great value for other countries interested in developing strategic plans for the integration of the concepts of entrepreneurship education and skills in their educational systems, both within or beyond the Arab region.

### b. Component I of the Project (2009-2010)

Under this component four case studies on the incorporation of entrepreneurship education in the educational systems in Egypt, Jordan, Oman and Tunisia have been conducted. The case studies enabled the assessment of national experiences in this field and the identification of examples of good practices that already exist in the region. Furthermore, a regional synthesis report revealing the outcome of the case studies, assessing the situation of entrepreneurship education in educational systems in the four countries and highlighting the needs and the priorities was published within the Arab region and in other parts of the world.

### c. Component II of the Project (2011-2012)

Component II of the project was designed to provide technical support to Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco and Oman in order to develop national strategic plans to promote the integration of entrepreneurship education in the education systems. Among the main objectives of component II of the project:

- The preparation of strategies and action plans for the integration of entrepreneurship education and the implementation of a national framework for entrepreneurship education, in partnership with the ministries and the government institutions, the private sector organizations and the non-governmental organizations;
- Setting priorities in entrepreneurship education that need financial and technical support from United Nations agencies and other international institutions;
- The dissemination and exchange of good practices and best practices in the field of entrepreneurship education among decision-makers and policy-makers at the government level and professionals in the region, for the purpose of making education and training curricula meet the national and regional requirements.

### 3. Major Achievements and Results

#### a. General Policy and Coordination

- **Jordan**

Within the framework of component I of the project, the case study showed that despite the existence of a well developed policy for Entrepreneurship Education, the implementation in terms of skill development and entrepreneurship initiative and behavior promotion still need much effort.

Within component II of the project a notable progress in this context has been realized; a steering committee including all concerned parties was designed to review the texts and documents related to the strategic plan and educational policies in order to develop a national strategy for the inclusion of entrepreneurship education in the educational system. A working team was also formed to set up a matrix of entrepreneurship education concepts, and to identify knowledge, competencies and skills in this area before embarking on the analysis of the methods to diagnose the state of entrepreneurship education in the Jordanian educational system. A framework guide to entrepreneurship education activities has been prepared and approved

- **Lebanon**

At the beginning of this pilot project a higher committee for coordination at the level of the Educational Center for Research and Development was set up and tasked to develop policies and strategies for the integration of entrepreneurship education in the educational system, to contribute in developing an action plan for the integration of entrepreneurship education and in deciding about the mechanisms for its implementation. The committee, involving representatives from the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (Advisor at the Minister cabinet commissioned to coordinate the work of the Committee, a General Director of Education and General Director of Technical and Vocational Education), the Educational Center for Research and Development President and representatives from the private sector (the Industrialists Association), was also to evaluate the steps of implementing the plan and lead the pilot project achieved within the framework of component II of the project "Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab countries."

As a second step, an executive committee for the project was created and tasked to study the curricula and the initiatives in the field of entrepreneurship education in Lebanon and abroad and propose the approach to integrate the concept of entrepreneurship education in the curricula and the annual programs, develop an integration action plan (e.g. training, follow-up, implementation evaluation), ensure its good implementation and secure the communication with the involved parts and the donors. This committee includes representatives from the General Directorate for Education, the Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education at the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, a representative of the Educational Center for Research and Development and a representative of the Association of Industrialists.

These committees have ensured the coordination of the pilot project implementation designed to integrate and evaluate entrepreneurship education. They have also

proposed a general framework for the inclusion of entrepreneurship education in the educational system.

As a result of the growing awareness among decision-makers of the importance of the concept of entrepreneurship and the need to include it not only in the curriculum, but also in the context of parallel activities outside educational institutions, a higher committee at the Ministry of Education and Higher Education was created at the end of this pilot project; it is concerned with leading the project of entrepreneurship education integration in general education and vocational training schools. This Committee is chaired by the Minister of Education and Higher Education. It consists of the President of the Educational Research and Development, the General Director of Education, General Director of vocational and technical education, the General Director of Higher Education, Adviser to the Minister for Vocational and Technical Education, Adviser to the Minister for International Cooperation, a representative of UNESCO, a representative of the International Labor Organization (ILO), and a representative of the European Training Foundation (ETF).

An Executive Committee at the level of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education has also been assigned to continue the realization of the project.

- **Morocco**

A working group composed of representatives from various departments of the Ministry of Education, representatives of the Academy of Casablanca and Rabat Academy - Salé - Zemmour - Zaer, and representatives from the Higher School of Technical Education Teachers Rabat (UNEVOC Centre) has been formed. The working group has appointed two committees (Committee on educational institutions and the Commission on Higher Education) to develop a roadmap for the integration of entrepreneurship education in the Moroccan educational system. The first step was to undertake a diagnosis to determine the availability of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and evaluate pilot experiments and projects and initiatives for entrepreneurship education. Among the most prominent findings of the diagnosis those relating to:

- The compatibility of teaching approaches with the project of reinforcing entrepreneurship education in the curriculum;
- The importance of decentralizing the management of educational institutions because they offer the possibility of greater openness towards the integration of entrepreneurship in the field of education and promote education for a long-term initiative; and
- The need to spread awareness about the concept of entrepreneurship widely with a focus on entrepreneurship and enterprise creation culture.

Also, in the framework of this project a study day and two workshops for teachers, administrators and other economic and social parts were organized. The first workshop was devoted to studying the situation of education for the initiative in the educational system and to the way of including it in the education and training system taking into account the approach of competencies, the need to develop the necessary tools and frameworks and the importance of the cooperation and the partnership between the various parts. However, the second workshop focused on proposing an action plan to

build a framework for entrepreneurship education and integrate it into the formal school curriculum.

- **Oman**

Referring to Component I survey, carried out in Oman, two national committees have been formed: A Main Committee and an Executive Committee. The first involved 11 members from - the Ministry of Education, the National Commission for Education, the National Career Guidance Centre, Sultan Qaboos University (SQU), College Deans and Lecturers, the Fund of Development for Youth Projects, the Ministry of Commerce and from the private sector- The main tasks of this committee are:

- Determine the knowledge, skills, and values which should be included in the Curriculum to improve the students' ability to deal with Entrepreneurship;
- Determine the educational programs that the National Career Guidance specialists could provide for the project implementation;
- Investigate the training and qualification opportunities that may be provided by private and public institutes in the Sultanate of Oman to enhance the learners' abilities in the area of entrepreneurship;
- Supervise the educational programs implemented in schools and recommend ways to improve them;
- Supervise the work of the Executive Committee.

The Executive Committee is headed by the Assistant DG of the National Career Guidance Center at the Ministry of Education and consists of members from the Ministry of Education, the National Career Guidance Center, and other members from the educational field -a School Principal, a Career Guidance Specialist and a teacher.

The main role and responsibilities of the Executive Committee are as follows:

- Review the general skills curriculum in relation with the knowledge, skills, and values proposed by the Main Committee;
- Provide activities in entrepreneurship for students in the Second Cycle and Post Basic Education (Grades 5 to 12) and include some in the *"Your Career Path"* books;
- Supervise the implementation of the programs approved by the Main Committee;
- Prepare a pack of material on entrepreneurship and train general skills teachers and Career Guidance specialists on how to conduct it in classrooms.

## **b. Curricula Revision and Development**

- **Jordan**

The team that is configured in the framework of the project adopted a common definition for entrepreneurship education and submitted a draft list of skills in this area. In a next step and in the context of the implementation of the adopted General Framework programme and the activity guide, the team analyzed and reviewed the content of the vocational education curriculum for the concerned grades and under the supervision and follow-up of the steering committee of the project. Six books were surveyed by the team: pre-vocational education (grade 8,9, and10- one book for each semester).Each book was surveyed by three members of the team. It has been cleared



that the entrepreneurship skills in the content of each book, from the perspective of entrepreneurship, are not presented in a proper manner. The team also developed criteria to be adopted by the designers of the activity guide and organized activities and training workshops for them.

- **Lebanon**

Following the meetings, the workshops and the training courses that have been organized, it was agreed on a set of general principles:

- First, the inclusion of entrepreneurship education in the curricula of general and vocational pre-university education;
- Second, the progressive insertion of this concept in various levels of education (general principles in the intermediate stage, and life skills in high school, and entrepreneurship at the university level);
- Third, considering the possible integration between educational activities and other activities outside the framework of education (i.e. clubs and projects).

In this context and after reviewing other available experiences in the field of entrepreneurship education and curriculum, such as those of UNESCO, the International Labor Organization (ILO) and the British Council, this concept was added as part of a model experiment within the topic related to economics and entrepreneurship in the curricula of the technology subject for the third grade of general education, and of the economics subject in secondary education, besides fixing special curricula for vocational and technical education at all levels. The experiment model included 20 general secondary schools and 12 schools of vocational or technical training; they have been selected on the basis of specific requirements, taking into account the geographical repartition. Also, there has been an adjustment to the curricula and a development of teachers' manuals and books appropriate to the implementation requirements, such as the annual repartition of lessons and equipment.

- **Morocco**

In the framework of the project, a national team of experts in the field of entrepreneurship education including twenty experts from regional coordinators and inspectors, headmasters and representatives of other institutions such as teacher training centers has been formed. A training course has been organized for them to deal with the finalization of a national strategy and with the formulation of the key elements of the national framework for entrepreneurship teaching.

The preparation of a national framework for entrepreneurship education is of great importance as it determines the general elements used to draw the road map for the inclusion of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and as the availability of a national framework enables the authorities to manage issues related to the integration of entrepreneurship education at the regional level, which allows to adapt strategies and formulas and educational activities in line with the specificities of each hand.

Among the important themes in the national framework for entrepreneurship education, which have been listed by the national team of experts, those that concern?

- The identification of concepts relating to entrepreneurship education, the development of the spirit initiative and entrepreneurship;
- The identification of the areas/fields included within entrepreneurship education that should be assisted;
- The identification of teaching approaches and methods to ensure entrepreneurship education;
- The listing of the targeted skills with a description of their contents;
- The determination of the pedagogical model required to consolidate the spirit and culture of the initiative in the educational system - which includes in its broad sense -the pupil's expectations and views concerning educational status, teaching process and methods, acquired knowledge and evaluation means, as well as the role and function of the teacher.
- Delegation roles and responsibilities related to the inclusion of entrepreneurship education and institutionalizing it;
- The identification of the forms of supervision and coaching when inserting this education;
- The identification of research platforms to improve the level of entrepreneurship education in the educational system.

In the context of the project also, pedagogical guidelines, a drafting for pilot schools teachers' and headmasters' training as well as a drafting of the experimental protocol for entrepreneurship education were developed. In addition, a pilot experiment for entrepreneurship education was conducted and assessed in experimental secondary schools.

- **Oman**

The working group which was formed by the Main Committee prepared a matrix of entrepreneurship concepts and skills. The matrix was sent to the Curriculum Directorate General and the National Career Guidance Center for feedback. Then, the new developed matrix was sent to specialists in entrepreneurship for evaluation. There were four different options about how to analyze the curriculum and the books of each subject. The options took into consideration the need to spend as less money and time as possible. Since the chosen method of analysis required more than 250,000 US Dollars, the committee decided to look into the option of working with the team that is preparing standards in all subjects from grade 1 to 12 and consider the analysis as a pilot for this work. The analysis will also include the technical and vocational curriculum but this will be carried out by TVET specialists.

The challenge facing the Committee is that conducting an appropriate analysis requires a lot of time, money and people; since it is not advisable to pull out teachers from their classrooms, the work will have to be done in evenings and weekends. A proposal was sent for approval and the committee is waiting for the feedback. The work implementation will not start before December 2012; that's because the project was not part of the 2012 budget of the Ministry of Education and the budget of UNESCO for Component II is not sufficient.

### c. Teachers and Instructors Training

- **Jordan**

Three seminars and workshops were organized for the benefit of 76 members among school headmasters, supervisors, curriculum specialists and staff.

Workshops were also organized for educators in pre-vocational phase and supervisors expected to be assigned to develop an entrepreneurship education guide, to train educators and supervisors or to participate later at the follow up and the activities assessment.

- **Lebanon**

Several training courses took place to promote the project and train teachers in general education and vocational education. The training course lasted six days for general school teachers where the focus was on the concepts and bases related to entrepreneurship. For vocational and technical education teachers, the training took a longer period starting with the general principles and ending with the way to carry out the project. These training courses and activities were tutored by ILO experts who worked on the implementation of the content of the program "**Know about Business-KAB**".

A series of workshops for selected primary and secondary school teachers and headmasters from public and private sectors also took place in addition to these teachers and headmasters, members of the committees, and representatives of the parties involved in the project attended these workshops. The aim of these seminars and workshops were to familiarize participants with the details of the project and its structure and the strategy of its implementation, gain the support and commitment of the participants, establish a platform of cooperation between headmasters and teachers, understand the participants' concerns and find ways to ease these concerns, and identify the administrative needs and mechanisms required for the implementation of the project.

- **Morocco**

In cooperation with the Office of the United States Agency for International Development in Rabat, a training course at Mohamed V University in Rabat and a second session at Hassan II University in Mohammedia were organized. The main objective of both sessions was to help faculty members at universities and members of the national team of experts to gain more experience in the field of entrepreneurship education.

- **Oman**

The Main committee discussed the issue and the consensus was to wait for the work on this area and to present the plan and ideas to a sample of teachers, but the implementation will come with the programs which will be approved at a later stage. The only training of teachers which will take place at this stage is about the analysis of the curriculum of all classes and their contribution at the workshop with the private sector.

#### d. Connectivity and Networking

- **Jordan**

All the concerned parties were involved in the project: the Steering Committee tasked to lead the implementation of the project, with representatives from the Ministry of Education (i.e. Department of Vocational Education, Curricula and textbooks); the Ministry of Higher Education, the United Nations Agency for Palestinian Refugees Rescue and Employment in the Near East (UNRWA); the Vocational Training Corporation (VTC); Jordanian National Commission for UNESCO; the Military Directorate of Education and Culture; Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs); the Private Sector; and European Training Foundation (ETF).

There have been attempts to attract associations and institutions from the private sector to participate in the project such as "Injaz", Business Development Centre, and the Queen Rania Foundation for Excellence in Education.

The building of a website for the project was also planned to facilitate the communication and the diffusion of "*Entrepreneurship for All*" culture.

- **Lebanon**

There has been coordination with many partners in this project and between official government general institutions, such as the Educational Center for Research and Development, the General Directorate for Education, the General Directorate of Technical Education and Vocational Training. Representatives from international organizations such as UNESCO Regional Office in Beirut, the International Labor Organization (ILO), and the ETF and from the private sector and non-governmental organizations such as the Lebanese Industrialists Association, the British Council, INJAZ and the Institute of Administration and Services, have also been involved.

A portal on the internet has been developed to ensure the communication between the trainees and trainers, and with the perpetrators of similar projects in other countries.

- **Morocco**

Great efforts have been made in the framework of the project in order to determine the relevant institutions for Entrepreneurship Education and connect them to each other at the national and regional levels.

The project was an opportunity for cooperation in the field of entrepreneurship education between the Ministry of National Education and many Moroccan educational and administrative institutions like the Moroccan National Commission for Education Science and Culture, and the Regional Academies of education and training in Casablanca area and in the Rabat - Salé - Zemmour - Zaer, the Office of Vocational Training and the Office of Vocational Training and promotion of employment, the Graduate School of Technical Education Teachers Rabat, and the National High School of Multi-media and systems analysis. The project was also an opportunity to open up to private sector organizations in efforts to integrate entrepreneurship education by taking the General Union of Moroccan Companies as a partner in the project, as well as the institutions of civil society actors in the area of entrepreneurship support through the partnership of INJAZ and Eljesr associations. In addition to national institutions,

there was cooperation in the context of the project with UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for TVET-Bonn, UNESCO Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States-Beirut, the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) Office in Rabat, and the University Institute for Teacher Training in Marseille, France.

As part of the activities aimed at reinforcing communication and networking, members of a working team created under the project took part in a seminar on "Business and Education to Create a New generation of Entrepreneurs," organized by the association "INJAZ-Morocco" and intended to activate entrepreneurial programmes designed for students in various educational institutions. They also participated in the round table organized in the framework of this seminar along with effective parties, economists, educators and members of the Association "INJAZ- Morocco". In addition, they participated in the World Summit Congress for Innovation in Education.

To be aware of the national experiences and keep the communication with several effective institutions in Morocco, it was necessary to learn about the experiences of the Regional Centre for Investment and of the National Agency for the Support of Capacities in Promoting Entrepreneurship and Competitiveness of Moroccan institution. Furthermore, collecting information about the experience of the UNICEF office in Rabat concerning the creation of the projects related to the psychological and social competencies which represents the basis of promoting entrepreneurship spirit among students was required.

A comparative analysis about international experiences, helped to learn about the best experiences and practices in a number of countries in the field of initiative spirit and entrepreneurship culture integration in the educational system. In this regard, it was of great use to explore the four case studies carried out in the framework of component I of the project (2009-2010), which involved Jordan, Tunisia, Oman and Egypt and to familiarize them, with the help of the UNESCO Office in Beirut, with what has been planned and done in the context of the project in both Lebanon and Jordan.

- **Oman**

Within the framework of the cooperation between the public sector and the private sector, a workshop involving 50 participants among which entrepreneurs, NGO representatives, higher education delegates, parents, students and job seekers, has been organized.

The objective of this workshop was to:

- Encourage more communication between the education institutes and the work place institutes;
- Listen to the points of view of the private sector on young Omani graduates;
- Establishing a dialogue between the government and the private sector in relation to preparing young Omanis to become an effective workforce;
- Develop the educational programs and the curriculum to include and integrate entrepreneurship skills;
- Help teachers to transfer entrepreneurship skills to their students; and recommend different options of transferring entrepreneurship skills to students.

## 4. Lessons Learnt

The attempts of promoting entrepreneurship education in the Arab states revealed the following:

- The development of a general policy for Entrepreneurship Education in the educational system is not enough. The level of implementation in terms of skill learning, initiative promotion and good entrepreneurship behavior should be excellent.
- The project planning in terms of temporal distribution of the activities and the starting date of the project is very important. Launching the project in the beginning of the academic year would be a great challenge for the team in charge of the implementation of the project.
- The coordination between educational institutions that have developed programs to teach entrepreneurship is essential since they are operating outside the framework of national strategies.
- Entrepreneurship training should start at a very early age, since kindergarten phase to plant the spirit of entrepreneurship amongst the future generations and get better results.
- The coordination between the various parties involved in the inclusion of entrepreneurship education is necessary and should continue and include donors and sponsors.
- The importance of getting the commitment and support of the parties involved in the implementation of the project (principals and teachers) and the need to communicate with all the partners concerned by the planning and implementation of the project.
- Having enough information on previous and ongoing experiences in and outside the country and evaluating them is of great importance in the preparation of the project and helps in the selection of topics and methods that can be used and integrated into the national curriculum.
- The need to provide secure communication tools via the Internet to facilitate the communication, the follow-up training and the monitoring of various resources as well as to diffuse the benefits among the participants and the interested institutions in the Arab region.
- Institutionalizing the process of integrating entrepreneurship education in the educational system is of great importance.
- Integrating entrepreneurship education phase by phase, targeting various educational phases and adopting the suitable methods and approaches that take into account the specificities of the educational system are major factors of success.
- The revision of the programs within the framework of the integration of entrepreneurship education should include the development of the initiative spirit and enterprise creation culture and should also include the design and preparation of common lesson plans and curricula evidence for educational activities inside and outside the classroom.
- The inclusion of entrepreneurship education in the educational system depends on the availability of the necessary mechanisms and procedures and on a clear and well developed framework.
- The implementation of any project related to the inclusion of entrepreneurship education requires the training of various actors, and the adoption of a participatory leadership style to the project taking into account the expectations and aspirations of all the parties or the beneficiaries involved in the project.

**The following are a number of lessons learned in terms of obstacles or difficulties that could adversely affect the implementation of the project:**

- The lack of a common definition to the concept of entrepreneurship at the national and international levels, which gives this concept different connotations varying according to the contexts.
- The absence of structures in the education and training system for the disposal of horizontal projects or programs which could result in a lack of coordination and harmonization and the inability to draw lessons from the converged pilot projects.
- The scarcity of experienced professionals in the field of entrepreneurship education at the national level.
- The difficulty to establish a real partnership with the social and economic parties involved in the integration of entrepreneurship education.
- The difficulty relating to sensitize and mobilize human resources for the implementation of the integration program of entrepreneurship education, and to the availability of financial resources and logistics to ensure the institutional character of entrepreneurship education and maintain the sustainability of the project.

**An analysis of the responses on the Final Evaluation Questionnaire, which falls within the framework of the final evaluation of entrepreneurship education project in the Arab countries, led to the following findings:**

- A complete agreement that the activities involved in the project enabled the reinforcement of entrepreneurship education in the educational systems:
  - 90.7% concerning the development of strategic plans to integrate the concepts of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and the review of public policies and existing frameworks
  - 81.2% concerning monitoring initiatives on entrepreneurship education
  - 75% concerning the creation of a unified conceptual matrix relating to entrepreneurship education
  - 91.2% for the development of curricula and study plans in the field of entrepreneurship education;
  - 90.6% concerning teachers'/ coaches training and developing teacher's guidelines
  - 93.8% for the cooperation with private sector organizations and business owners
- Concerning the educational institutions contribution in the creation of a unified conceptual matrix relating to education for Entrepreneurship it was viewed as unsatisfactory; for, only 46.9% of the enquired people expressed approved of these institutions efforts (21.9% total agreement - 25% agreement), while 37.5% were neutral and 9.4% found it insufficient.
- UNESCO's contribution in support of entrepreneurship education can be considered effective through:
  - Supporting decision-makers to develop strategic plans to integrate the concepts of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and review existing policies and frameworks. (40.6% total agreement - 37.5% agreement - 6.3% disagreement).
  - Monitoring and disseminating initiatives on entrepreneurship education. (37.5% total agreement - 37.5% agreement - 6.3% disagreement).
  - Establishing a unified matrix of concepts relating to entrepreneurship education (59.4% agreed and 21.9% were neutral).
  - Developing curricula and study plans in the field of entrepreneurship education. (75% expressed agreement, 6.3% did not consider the contribution to UNESCO effective and 15.6% were neutral).

- Contributing in the training of teachers, coaches and the development of teachers' guidelines. (78.1% agreed, 9.4% did not consider the UNESCO contribution effective and 9.4% showed neutrality).
- Supporting the cooperation with the private sector organizations and business owners(62.5% considered the UNESCO contribute effective, but 12.5% did not agree and 21.9% were neutral).
- Supporting entrepreneurship education at the regional level as a complementary part to the adopted policies and programs.(85% expressed their agreement and 12.5% were neutral while 6.3% did not agree).
- The responses to the questionnaire also showed that the contribution of international organizations was necessary for:
  - The development of curricula and study plans in the field of entrepreneurship education (60%);
  - The training of teachers, trainers and providing them with empirical evidence (56%);
  - The development of strategic plans to integrate the concepts of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and the review of the existing policies and frameworks (25%);
  - The establishment of a unified matrix of concepts relating to education for Entrepreneurship (20%);
- Concerning the activities that should be considered in the future to support entrepreneurship education in the educational system It has been asserted on the following proposals:
  - Supplying further support to developing the strategic plans, reviewing the general policy and the existing frameworks of the incorporation of entrepreneurship education in the educational system (46%);
  - Developing the curricula and the education plans in the field of entrepreneurship education (40%);
  - Reinforcing the training of teachers and trainers (37%);
  - Monitoring, publicizing and disseminating initiatives in the field of entrepreneurship education (25%);
  - Collaborating with the private sector and the business owners (12.5%);
  - Sensitizing parents and to carrying out activities for this purpose outside educational institutions (i.e. clubs and associations), (12.5%).



## 5. Conclusions and Recommendations

- a. It has been obvious throughout this report that the project goals in Component I and II were rational and met with the objectives, strategies and policies of Arab countries. The project was also compatible with programs conducted by governments and other local and international parties.
- b. The design of the project (including the complementary relationship between activities, the financial allocations, the arrangements for the project management, the supervision and implementation support, the monitoring adjustment and evaluation arrangements) was appropriate to the objectives expected from the project and to the objectives of the organization as a whole. The participative aspect of the project also led to the involvement of government institutions and direct or indirect beneficiaries in leading and implementing the project taking into account their suggestions and requirements.
- c. Regarding the efficiency, it should be noted that it was not easy to estimate the efficiency of non-material output and capacity building. It is to note also, that the costs of the project and the administrative costs per beneficiary did not exceed a relatively acceptable level. The extending of the original closing date for Component II of the project did not seem to have caused additional administrative costs either.
- d. Concerning the effectiveness, the project has succeeded in achieving the targeted outputs at the national level. However, despite the importance of the project outputs in terms of quality, it should be noted that these outputs were not enough compared with the needs at the national level, a thing that limits the achievement of the objectives of the project in the beneficiary countries. In addition, the weak interaction between recipient countries is expected to reduce the success of the project and slow down the achievement of the objectives at the regional level.
- e. Concerning the probability of preserving the benefits of the project after its accomplishment, we note that the situation differs from one country to another. While it seems that the adoption of the project by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education in Lebanon would ensure the continuation of work in order to achieve the goals of entrepreneurship education integration and to reinforce the project outputs, doing so in Morocco depends on the institutionalization of the project integration according to the requirements of the disposition of such projects and programs that require horizontal coordination between a number of ministries overseeing several intervening parties. It should be noted also, that there is no clear signal referring to the commitment of governments to work on the project for the further implementation of the action plans when it comes to an end (i.e. providing financial and human support).
- f. The assessment of the long-term impact of the project outputs were positive and showed the importance of the achievements. However, the impact of the project risks to be limited in terms of expert formation owing to the limited number of beneficiaries and to the exclusive reliance on short-term training workshops, which is not enough to develop skills among users in the field of entrepreneurship education. Besides, the impact of the project on the educational system in the beneficiary countries is limited; its outputs, in spite of its importance, remains an essential first step that should be reinforced and continued through pilot projects or other major educational projects. Entrepreneurship reinforcement in society depends on the adoption of a comprehensive strategy and horizontal projects considering the integration of entrepreneurship education in the holistic concept of entrepreneurship and the multiplicity of its aspects.

With reference to the lessons learned from this project and to the good practices that have been monitored with regard to the inclusion of entrepreneurship education and the results of the evaluation process, the Evaluator/Consultant (Dr. Jilani Lamoumi) based on the evaluation exercise would like to recommend the following (for the Arab Countries and UNESCO) participating in Entrepreneurship Education Projects and Initiatives:

#### **5.1 For the Arab Countries:**

- Set up a clear national strategy for the integration of entrepreneurship education in the educational and training systems and curricula during general education, technical or professional education and higher education;
- Conduct assessment studies and comprehensive diagnostics of the situation at the local level and benefit from its results;
- Activate the legislation, the laws and the policies pertaining to entrepreneurship education and develop a clear strategy and a comprehensive and accurate plan process for the integration of entrepreneurship education in the official programmes considering any required review for the programs and the pedagogical methods;
- Train teachers to use the correct and suitable methodology for entrepreneurship education and include entrepreneurship education in the teachers' initial formation programs and in the continuous training programmes;
- Conduct research projects in the field of entrepreneurship education to identify the results and the impacts of the current applications and to stimulate new ideas and applications;
- Focus on the appliance side through developing the system based on content to a system based on skills;
- Encourage the cooperation between public and private sectors in the field of training teachers and students to acquire entrepreneurship practical skills;
- Provide the necessary support and assistance to diffuse entrepreneurship spirit in the educational system and in the society as a whole.

#### **5.2 For UNESCO**

- Encourage the implementation of some activities or joint projects at the local and regional level;
- Take into account the restrictions preventing the educational institutions to have enough authority to use the money allocated to them and therefore slowing down the ongoing of the project;
- Ensure the good management of similar projects that could be implemented in other countries it is recommended to create a higher committee to lead the project and an executive committee at the level of the Ministry of Education with well determined functions and to stimulate the effective participation of civil society organizations and the private sector in their activities. It is also recommended to set up similar committees concerned with the higher education sector;
- Predetermine the criteria for the selection of the educational institutions which would participate in the project and of the beneficiaries of its activities and identify their rights and duties with respect to the project;
- Preset the implementation plan of the project taking into account the administrative and logistic issues and taking into account the need for adequate funds, appropriate launch time (avoid the synchronization with the start of the academic year) and suitable timing for the activities;

- Enhance the communication and the networking among the participants in the project implementation and the beneficiaries and benefit from the internet to set up an Arab portal for entrepreneurship education;
- Benefit from the successful experiences in a number of Arab and foreign countries and encourage the exchange of experiences and expertise through regional and international cooperation.

## References

- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States – case studies of the Arab states (Jordan, Tunisia, Oman and Egypt) and Regional Synthesis Report UNESCO – April 2010.
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization-UNESCO; International Labour Office-ILO (2006). *Towards an entrepreneurial culture for the twenty-first century*. Paris/Geneva: UNESCO/ILO.
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: JORDAN. Mid -Term Report (04-10-2011).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: JORDAN. Mid -Term Report-Phase II (30 October 2012).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: Jordan. Contract Final Report July 2011-January 2012 (02-02-2012).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: LEBANON. Mid -Term Report (15 September 2011).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: LEBANON. Final report (January 2012).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: MOROCCO. Mid -Term Report (September 2011).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: MOROCCO. Report two (January 2012).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: MOROCCO. Final Report (November 2012).
- Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States. Component Two: SOLTANATE of OMAN. Mid-Term Report (November 2012).

## Annex 1: Project Coordinators/Focal Points

Name	Title	Institution/Country	E-mail
Mr. Ahmad Shedid	Director, Vocational Education and Production Department	Ministry of Education, Jordan	Ahmed_shadeed2005@yahoo.com
Mr. Oussama Ghneim	Head, Technical and Vocational Education Department	Center for Educational Research and Development, Lebanon	oghneim@yahoo.com
Mr. Nouredine Mazouni	Chief of Division, National Center of Pedagogical Innovation and Experimentation	Ministry of Education, Morocco	Nourdine.elmazouni@men.gov.ma
Dr. Sana Al-Bulishi	Director General, National Center for Vocational Guidance	Ministry of Education, Oman	sana@moe.om sanasabeel@hotmail.com
Ms. Lisa Freiburg	Communication Focal Point	UNESCO-UNEVOC; Bonn	l.freiburg@unesco.org
Dr. Sulieman Sulieman	Programme Specialist: STV	UNESCO Regional Bureau-Beirut	s.sulieman@unesco.org

## Annex 2: Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States Project (2009–2012) Final Evaluation Questionnaire

This questionnaire falls within the framework of the final evaluation of the project “Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States” jointly implemented by UNESCO and the StratREAL Foundation. This project, intends to contribute to the development of strategies integrating entrepreneurship education in the beneficiary countries. It is in accordance with various activities and programs implemented in the region by non-governmental organizations, local associations, international cooperation agencies and some private stakeholders.

In this respect, providing appropriate feedback to the enclosed questionnaire will be highly appreciated. Your insights will be of great value and will certainly help us reach the desired results and bring about the appropriate recommendations which hopefully will contribute to the creation of entrepreneurship culture amongst students and trainees.

Note: All information provided in this questionnaire is considered confidential and will be exclusively used for the evaluation purposes.

### I. GENERAL DATA :

1. **Name:** .....
2. **Current position:**  General director  Director  Project manager  
 Expert  
 .....
3. **Country:** .....
4. **Are you among the participants in the Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States Project?**  
 Yes : .....  
 No
5. **Are you among the beneficiaries of the Entrepreneurship Education in the Arab States Project?**  
 Yes : .....  
 No

**II. Please tick the box that best expresses the extent to which you either agree or disagree with the statements.**

Statement		Strongly agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree	Strongly disagree
1	Entrepreneurship education is a priority in the national development plans and educational programs in your country.					
2	Entrepreneurship education policies and programs in your country have undergone a remarkable degree of development during the last four years.					
3	Educational programs in your country aim to improve the learner's personal abilities and further enhance his chances to address employment and citizenship issues.					
4	The following activities support the integration of entrepreneurship education in the educational system in your country:					
4.1	<i>Supporting decision-makers to develop strategic plans to integrate the concept of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and review the existing policies.</i>					
4.2	<i>Studying and disseminating the initiatives on entrepreneurship education.</i>					
4.3	<i>Setting up a unified conceptual matrix relating to entrepreneurship education.</i>					
4.4	<i>Developing curricula and study plans in the field of entrepreneurship education.</i>					
4.5	<i>Assuring teachers' training and developing teaching guidelines.</i>					
4.6	<i>Networking and collaborating with private sector institutions.</i>					
5	The educational institutions in your country contribute effectively to the integration of entrepreneurship education in the education and training systems through:					
5.1	<i>Participation in the development of strategic plans to integrate the concepts of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and in the review of existing policies and frameworks.</i>					
5.2	<i>Taking initiatives in entrepreneurship education.</i>					
5.3	<i>Setting up a unified conceptual matrix relating to entrepreneurship education.</i>					
5.4	<i>Developing curricula and study plans in the field of entrepreneurship education.</i>					
5.5	<i>Assuring teachers' training and developing teaching guidelines.</i>					
5.6	<i>Networking and collaboration with private sector institutions.</i>					

Statement	Strongly agree	Agree	Neutral	Disagree	Strongly disagree
6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The contribution of UNESCO in support of entrepreneurship education in your country (or in Arab countries) is effective regarding :</li> </ul>				
6.1	<i>Supporting decision-makers to develop strategic plans to integrate the concept of entrepreneurship education in the educational system and review the existing policies.</i>				
6.2	<i>Studying and disseminating the initiatives on entrepreneurship education.</i>				
6.3	<i>Setting up a unified conceptual matrix relating to entrepreneurship education.</i>				
6.4	<i>Developing curricula and study plans in the field of entrepreneurship education.</i>				
6.5	<i>Teacher training and development of teaching guidelines.</i>				
6.6	<i>Networking and collaboration with private sector institutions.</i>				
7	UNESCO's contribution in supporting entrepreneurship education at the regional level is a complementary part to adopted policies and programs in your country.				

### III. Please answer the following questions:

1. What are the achievements relating to entrepreneurship education in your country (or in Arab countries) that would not have been realized without the UNESCO's contribution?

1.1:

.....

1.2:

.....

1.3:

.....

1.4:

.....

2. Could you please suggest activities that should be considered in the future to support entrepreneurship education in your country?

2.1:

.....

2.2:

.....

2.3:

.....

2.4:

.....